**Heart of the South West Local Transport Board** **29 September 2015**

**Item 9**

**Growth Deal 3 Schemes – Initial Review of Submitted Expressions of Interest**

**Introduction**

A total of 27 Project Outlines for transport schemes have been submitted for consideration. In aggregate they are seeking £117m of Local Growth Fund support towards an overall total project sum of £213m.

 Some of the proposals are schemes which have been considered as candidates in previous Growth Deal rounds, some are modifications of previous proposals and some are new schemes. In addition to submissions from the four Local Transport Authorities there are proposals from the private sector and district councils.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Promoter | Scheme | Total cost £m | LGF bid£m | % Local contribution |
| Devon | Deep Lane Phase 2 and Park and Ride | 12.00 | 8.00 | 33.4 |
| Devon | Roundswell Phase 3 | 3.50 | 2.00 | 43.9 |
| Devon | Houghton Barton Package | 20.00 | 13.00 | 35.0 |
| Devon | Exe Cycle Routes | 5.45 | 3.40 | 37.7 |
| Devon | Exeter Bus Station | 6.00 | 5.00 | 16.7 |
| Devon | Strategic Rural Cycle Routes | 6.00 | 3.00 | 50.0 |
| Devon | South West Exeter Park & Change | 8.00 | 6.00 | 25.0 |
| Exeter & Devon Airport Ltd | Exeter International Airport Terminal & Long Lane Infrastructure | 1.875 | 1.375 | 26.7 |
| Plymouth | Plymouth Central Railway Station | 25.37 | 5.00 | 80.0 |
| Plymouth | Morlaix Drive Access Improvement & Bus Priority | 1.688 | 0.844 | 50.0 |
| Plymouth | Woolwell to the George Improvement | 13.207 | 9.289 | 29.6 |
| Plymouth | Cattedown Junction Improvement | 7.836 | 3.918 | 50.0 |
| Plymouth | Pomphlett to the Ride Improvement | 19.525 | 13.868 | 30.0 |
| Red Kite | Royal Bath & West Showground Food Enterprise Park – Gateway & Access | 13.50 | 1.75 | 50.0 |
| Somerset | Bridgwater Celebration Mile Phase 2 | 1.47 | 1.03 | 30.0 |
| Somerset | Chard Millfield Link Road | 4.42 | 3.02 | 31.5 |
| Somerset | Crewkerne Key Site Link Road | 7.50 | 2.00 | 73.4 |
| Somerset | Huntspill Energy Park Access & A38 Dunball roundabout, Puriton, Bridgwater | 8.25 | 4.12 | 51.1 |
| Somerset | Taunton Cross Keys & Silk Mills Junctions | 3.11 | 2.04 | 34.5 |
| Somerset | Taunton Toneway Corridor Capacity Improvements | 13.88 | 9.55 | 31.2 |
| Torbay | Torquay Rethink | 6.70 | 5.00 | 25.4 |
| Torbay | Edginswell Station (bid for additional funds) | 9.557 | 4.607 | 10.0 |
| Torbay | Paignton Refresh | 6.50 | 4.80 | 26.4 |
| South Somerset | Market Street Junct/ A30 Yeovil Eastern Corridor | 1.20 | 0.60 | 50.0 |
| South Somerset | Yeovil walking and cycling network | 1.50 | 0.35 | 76.7 |
| First Great Western | Castle Cary Parkway | 0.77 | 0.30 | 61.0 |
| First Great Western | Devon Metro Stations Package | 4.50 | 3.50 | 22.0 |

Copies of the Project Outline submissions will be made available for LTB Members to review via the Jacobs file transfer site. A brief summary of each project is included as Annex A.

**Initial consideration of the Project Proposals**

The 27 project outlines have been reviewed separately by two members of the Independent Transport Assessment team. As previously this has involved two stages:-

* Sifting – testing the submissions against a number of criteria to ascertain whether the projects are likely to satisfy basic requirements of the LTB transport programme
* Prioritisation – scoring the submissions against the weighted objectives of the LTB

It should be noted that the project outlines are less comprehensive in terms of detail than the major scheme Early Assessment and Sifting Tool submissions considered by the LTB team in 2013. Also, the project outlines have been completed by a wider range of promoters this time, some of whom are less familiar with the requirements of transport assessment.

As a consequence the initial stage, sifting, has given rise to a number of issues where further clarification will be required from promoters.

Another consideration at the sifting stage is whether the LTB, or LEP, has any particular perspective about the Growth Deal 3 programme – either in terms of the nature of schemes it is looking to support, or their scale. For example, if the overall size of the Growth Deal 3 programme for the Heart of the South West is likely to be limited, might some of the proposals be “unaffordable” in this Growth Deal round, and should bids be restricted to within a certain cost range?

**Sifting Issues**

The initial review suggested that the following issues might be relevant, and that they might pose questions for the promoters of a number of schemes. The list below is indicative, rather than comprehensive, and is intended to give the LTB an overview of the initial ITA thinking.

**Affordability** – Given the likely scale of GD3 are some schemes too costly to be afforded?

Deep Lane Phase 2 and Park and Ride

Houghton Barton Package

South West Exeter Park & Change

Woolwell to the George

Pomphlett to the Ride Improvement

Taunton Toneway Corridor Improvements (but possibly scalable)

**Deliverability** – Potential of major risks, e.g land, procedures

Houghton Barton

South West Exeter Park & Change

**Value for Money uncertainty**

Devon Strategic rural cycle routes

Exeter Airport terminal and Long Lane

Plymouth Central station

Morlaix Drive Access/ Bus improvements

Royal Bath and West Showground

Celebration Mile, Bridgwater

Yeovil Market St/A30 junction

Yeovil walking and cycling network

Castle Cary Parkway

Devon Metro stations

**State aid questions**

Exeter bus station

Exeter Airport terminal and Long Lane

Castle Cary Parkway

Devon Metro stations

**Prioritisation**

In view of the fact that further consideration would need to be made of sifting criteria, and additional information would be sought from promoters, all the 27 projects submitted have been subjected to scoring under the framework which was used in 2013, reflecting the LTB objectives which were re-affirmed at the last LTB meeting.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Objective | Weighting | Maximum score |
| Support growth/ economic development | 5 | 15 |
| Reduce Carbon | 1 | 3 |
| Improve safety | 1 | 3 |
| Improve distribution of social impacts | 1 | 3 |
| Promote physical activity | 1 | 3 |
| Improve air quality/ reduce noise | 1 | 3 |
| Value for money | 3 | 9 |
| Level of local contribution | 3 | 9 |
| Quality of evidence and deliverability | 1 | 3 |
| Public and stakeholder support | 1 | 3 |

Scoring against each objective is assessed on a 0 -3 scale. The projects have been scored separately by two members of the Independent Transport Assessment team, and the outcomes compared.

One particular issue is in assessment of the scale of local contributions to the scheme cost. Here the scale used by the LTB previously differs from that used by the LEP for other Growth Deal bids.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Level of local contribution/ Score | LTB scoring | LEP scoring |
| Large – score 3 | 30% or greater local contribution | 70% or greater local contribution |
| Medium – score 2 | 20% to 30% local cont. | 50% to 50% local cont. |
| Small – score 1 | 10% to 20% local cont. | Less than 50% local cont. |
| Very small – score 0 | Less than 10%/ no information |  |

The GD3 projects have been scored twice, to illustrate the potential sensitivity of the prioritisation to such an issue. The table below shows the indicative priority order from one of the ITA team assessments, based on the different scoring for local contributions.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Scheme listing with scoring based upon the LTB assessment of local contributions | Scheme listing with scoring based upon the LEP assessment of local contributions |
| Huntspill Energy Park Access & A38 Dunball  | 38 | Huntspill Energy Park Access & A38 Dunball | 35 |
| Exe Cycle routes | 38 | Royal Bath & West Showground Gateway | 33 |
| Royal Bath & West Showground Gateway  | 36 | Exe Cycle routes | 32 |
| Houghton Barton Package | 35 | Crewkerne Key Site Link Road | 30 |
| Deep Lane Phase 2 and Park and Ride | 34 | Cattedown Junction Improvement | 30 |
| Taunton Toneway Corridor Improvements | 34 | Edginswell Station (bid for additional funds) | 30 |
| Cattedown Junction Improvement | 33 | Strategic Rural Cycle Routes | 29 |
| Pomphlett to the Ride Improvement | 33 | Houghton Barton Package | 29 |
| Strategic Rural Cycle Routes | 32 | Woolwell to the George Improvement | 29 |
| Woolwell to the George Improvement | 32 | Pomphlett to the Ride Improvement | 29 |
| Chard Millfield Link Road | 31 | Deep Lane Phase 2 and Park and Ride | 28 |
| Castle Cary Parkway station | 30 | Taunton Toneway Corridor Improvements | 28 |
| Crewkerne Key Site Link Road | 30 | Castle Cary Parkway station | 27 |
| Edginswell Station (bid for additional funds) | 30 | Morlaix Drive Access & Bus Priority | 27 |
| Morlaix Drive Access & Bus Priority | 30 | Plymouth Central Railway Station | 26 |
| Taunton Cross Keys & Silk Mills Junctions | 28 | Yeovil walking & cycling network | 26 |
| Roundswell Phase 3 | 27 | Chard Millfield Link Road | 25 |
| Plymouth Central Railway Station | 26 | Taunton Cross Keys & Silk Mills Junctions | 22 |
| Yeovil walking & cycling network | 26 | South West Exeter Park & Change | 21 |
| Bridgwater Celebration Mile Phase 2 | 26 | Roundswell Phase 3 | 21 |
| South West Exeter Park & Change | 24 | Torquay Rethink | 21 |
| Torquay Rethink | 24 | Devon Metro station upgrades | 21 |
| Yeovil Market St Junction/ A30 Eastern Corridor | 24 | Yeovil Market St Junction/ A30 Eastern Corridor | 21 |
| Devon Metro station upgrades | 24 | Bridgwater Celebration Mile Phase 2 | 20 |
| Exeter Airport Terminal & Long Lane  | 23 | Exeter bus station | 20 |
| Paignton Refresh | 22 | Exeter Airport Terminal & Long Lane | 20 |
| Exeter bus station | 20 | Paignton Refresh | 19 |

It must be stressed that the above table represents an early view of the relative strength of the various project outlines, from an initial reading of the information contained within them. However there is a need for discussion with each of the promoters to clarify aspects of their submissions, while the conclusions on the sifting issues identified above could have a significant impact.

The above analysis has been conducted without benefit of information about the scale of the likely Growth Deal bid, or any consideration of how the transport programme might relate to other bids which have been submitted as project outlines. LEP priorities for Growth Deal 3 may have an impact on the objectives of the transport programme, or on the relative weightings.

Experience of Growth Deal 1 suggests that there could be some merit in “bundling” the candidate schemes into thematic groupings, such as:-

* Gateway transport projects/ public transport
* Schemes to bring forward strategic employment sites
* Improving public realm to attract investment in employment
* Unlocking significant housing sites
* Decongesting transport networks to support general growth
* Schemes to support the rural economy

An indicative breakdown of the project list into such themes will be presented at the meeting.

There could also be merit in including within the Growth Deal transport programme a bid to support the theme of longer term infrastructure planning – particularly relating to the influencing role of the LEP on national networks. This would encompass the work of the Peninsula Rail Task Force in advising government on priorities for investment, and the need to advise Highways England of the LEP priorities for the future Roads Investment Strategy.

**Next Steps**

It would be helpful to have a perspective from the Board on its priorities for Growth Deal 3, and in particular:-

1. Whether it supports the principle of grouping the project bids into thematic programmes
2. Whether it supports the principle of including within the Growth Deal 3 bid a specific strand of work for developing the case for longer term investments on strategic networks
3. Whether it wishes to define a maximum cost or support level for Growth Deal 3 projects

After the LTB meeting it is suggested that further discussions be held with the promoters of the individual projects to clarify/refine their proposals, particularly in light of the sifting issues identified above.

This would enable the Board to have a further discussion on prioritisation, either by meeting or telephone conference, as Government and LEP timescales become clearer during the autumn.

**Annex 1**

**Growth Deal 3 Scheme Outlines**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Scheme | Outline | Cost £m |
| Deep Lane Phase 2 and Park and Ride | Revised junction with new slip road and park and ride site, to mitigate impact of Sherford | 12.00 |
| Roundswell Phase 3 | Business park access and new park & change site at Barnstaple | 3.50 |
| Houghton Barton Package | Link road between A383 and A382 to support new development west of Newton Abbot and improvements to the A382 | 20.00 |
| Exe Cycle Routes | Cycle routes to link City Centre with new development areas East of Exeter and South West Exeter  | 5.45 |
| Exeter Bus Station | Provision of a replacement bus station alongside city centre leisure development | 6.00 |
| Strategic Rural Cycle Routes | Completion of long distance recreational cycle routes by construction of “missing links” | 6.00 |
| South West Exeter Park & Change | Additional park & change site to serve the A30 west of Exeter and to support city centre expansion | 8.00 |
| Exeter International Airport Terminal & Long Lane Infrastructure | Improved forecourt and access arrangements for terminal/ widened route to Flybe academy and hotel to support further business growth | 1.875 |
| Plymouth Central Railway Station | Transformational redevelopment of station site to act as key gateway for the city centre | 25.37 |
| Morlaix Drive Access Improvement & Bus Priority | Creation of a bus priority route from Derriford Hospital enabling buses to bypass Derriford roundabout | 1.688 |
| Woolwell to the George Improvement | Dualling of the A386 between the George junction and Woolwell roundabout | 13.207 |
| Cattedown Junction Improvement | Replacement of Cattedown roundabout with a signalised crossroads to support Eastern Corridor growth | 7.836 |
| Pomphlett to the Ride Improvement | Widening of the A379 east of Laira Bridge, and remodelling of the Pomphlett junction to provide bus priority lanes and accommodate Eastern Corridor growth | 19.525 |
| Royal Bath & West Showground Food Enterprise Park – Gateway & Access | Junction improvements to support development of a food enterprise park | 13.50 |
| Bridgwater Celebration Mile Phase 2 | Public realm upgrade on route from station to town centre | 1.47 |
| Chard Millfield Link Road | Link road to support local development and provide relief to congestion at key central junction | 4.42 |
| Crewkerne Key Site Link Road | Link road to support local development and provide relief to congestion in town centre | 7.50 |
| Huntspill Energy Park Access & A38 Dunball roundabout, Puriton, Bridgwater | Access route to major employment site bypassing existing community | 8.25 |
| Taunton Cross Keys & Silk Mills Junctions | Junction improvements west of Taunton which also give access to development area | 3.11 |
| Taunton Toneway Corridor Capacity Improvements | Junction improvements on major link to Taunton from M5 which also enhance capacity to support urban extension | 13.88 |
| Torquay Rethink | Public realm enhancement to strengthen links between the Harbourside and town centre and support business investment | 6.70 |
| Edginswell Station (bid for additional funds) | Established Growth Deal 1 seeking additional funding to meet increased cost estimate | 9.557 |
| Paignton Refresh | Enhanced public realm and multi modal facilities in Paignton town centre and improved connectivity to west Paignton | 6.50 |
| Market Street Junct/ A30 Yeovil Eastern Corridor | Junction improvement adjacent to Yeovil town centre to support mixed use development in central area | 1.20 |
| Yeovil walking and cycling network | Completion of walking and cycling routes linking development areas in eastern Yeovil | 1.50 |
| Castle Cary Parkway | Expansion of parking at Castle Cary station to turn it into a gateway station with more frequent train links to London | 0.77 |
| Devon Metro Stations Package | Platform extensions and station enhancements to support growth of patronage and longer trains on the Devon Metro network | 4.50 |